



Democratic Support

Plymouth City Council
Civic Centre
Plymouth PL1 2AA

Please ask for Helen Rickman,
Democratic Support Officer
T (01752) 398444
E helen.rickman@plymouth.gov.uk
www.plymouth.gov.uk/democracy
Published 12 February 2014

#plymreview

**SCRUTINY - COOPERATIVE SCRUTINY REVIEWS
CONTROLLED PARKING ZONES (ON STREET PARKING)
SUPPLEMENT (2)**

Meeting dates:

	1	2	3	4
Date	16 December 2013	6 January 2014	6 February 2014	17 February 2014
Time	3pm	3pm	4pm	3pm
Venue	Council House	Council House	Council House	Council House

Members:

Councillor Darcy, Chair

Councillors Martin Leaves, Sam Leaves, Murphy, Mrs Nelder, Singh and Wheeler.

Please find enclosed additional information for your consideration under agenda item number 5.4 and 5.7. This information is to be discussed at the 17 February 2014 scrutiny meeting.

Tracey Lee

Chief Executive

SCRUTINY - COOPERATIVE SCRUTINY REVIEWS

PART I - PUBLIC MEETING

AGENDA

5.4. WITNESSES **(Pages 1 - 6)**

Witness information will be published during the course of the review.

5.7. BENCHMARKING DATA **(Pages 7 - 12)**

COOPERATIVE SCRUTINY REVIEW

Controlled Parking Zones (On Street Parking)

Witness statements



Gary Streeter MP	'Not aware of too much pressure to introduce more schemes like this in Plympton/ Plymstock but am grateful for the opportunity to comment'
Alison Seabeck MP	<p>'I am pleased that Plymouth City Council are carrying out a review into the current parking situation and the operational efficacy of Controlled Parking Zones. I welcome the opportunity to comment and share my views and experiences.</p> <p>Parking is an issue which certainly makes the top 10 of my postbag and is also regularly raised when I knock on doors. I have particularly been picking up concerns about parking problems in residential areas which are close to large public buildings, such as Derriford Hospital or Crownhill Police Station. When canvassing the area around Derriford Hospital, i.e. Rogate Drive and Challock Close, concerns were raised that Marjon and hospital staff were parking in residential roads and thus exacerbating the already tight parking situation. In a spot survey I asked constituents whether they thought that a residential parking permit might help. The outcome at the time was 50:50.</p> <p>Equal concerns were raised with me around Crownhill Police Station, with staff using residential parking in the area.</p> <p>Other regular concerns involve parking and drop-off points at schools, the blocking of driveways, parking on double yellow lines (particularly in the area around West Park shops/Parade Road) and associated lack of enforcement. Others have also raised issues around access and egress for emergency vehicles where there was tight and/or inconsiderate parking.</p> <p>No doubt, asking residents to pay for residential parking would not be a popular suggestion and if a scheme were to be implemented, it would only be as good as its enforcement – which is something many of my constituents feel is almost non-existent. There would have to be careful weighing up whether the benefits outweigh the costs and operational effort. However, given the generally rising number in vehicles in roads which were not built with that in mind, a long-term solution may only be possible when considering residential parking permits. Any scheme would have to be a low cost one and ideally offset against other measures so as to not penalise residents too harshly.'</p>
Councillor John Smith	'Not aware of any issues in the Southway ward.'
Councillor Rennie	Believes they have already been raised by Councillor Nelder.
Councillor P Davey/	'We have a consistent issue with residents in Whittington

S Davey	Street, De La Hay Avenue and Amherst Road who want residents parking and attend every single Have Your Say meeting to see when the review will be complete and when they can or cannot have restricted parking to stop people parking and leaving their cars all day. This has been a neighbourhood priority for at least 3 years.'	
Neighbourhood Liaison Officer for Mount Gould	Road/Street	Known problem
	Mount Gould Road	There is currently a large number of vehicles parking on Mount Gould Road outside residents houses, these vehicles are mostly patients visiting Mount Gould Hospital. There is adequate parking in the hospital and it is free parking. Often residents have to park away from their houses.
	Freedom Fields area	It has been reported at various neighbourhood meetings that parking in and around the park there has been dangerous parking.
	Roseberry Close/Avenue	Residents have reported dangerous/inconsiderate parking in Roseberry Avenue/Roseberry Close and have been unable to access their houses and garages.
	Chaddlewood Avenue junction of Beaumont Road	Dangerous parking has been reported on the junction of Chaddlewood Avenue and Beaumont Road. There have been reports of the refuse lorries being unable to gain access to empty wheelie bins due to inconsiderate parking in this area.
Neighbourhood Liaison Officer for Eggbuckland	'I'm a quite newly appointed NLO for Eggbuckland. I'm told we have no CPZ in the area'.	

<p>Neighbourhood Liaison Officer for Stoke</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ‘De La Hay Avenue and Whittington Street would like resident parking with restrictions on permit parking between 08.30 – 09.15am • Double yellow lines on Ford Hill and Milehouse Road need to be repaired so that they can be enforced. Vans park on the double yellow lines causing an obstruction.’
<p>Neighbourhood Liaison Officer for Stonehouse</p>	<p>‘Stonehouse neighbourhood has various CPZs and the following issues persist:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inconsistent application of TRO across the area. Several areas have TRO’s in place in some streets but then no TRO in neighbouring streets. This is particularly prevalent in Millbay where residents in Emma Place/Caroline Place/George Place have to pay for parking passes, but businesses appear able to park on pavements/incompletely marked areas without penalty just around the corner – this creates resentment and frustration; Claremont St has a CPZ on part of the street, but the rest is unrestricted – the whole street is used primarily by commuters and residents feel there is a strong case for it to all be residents parking. • TROs in place do not effectively manage the inconsiderate parking issues at all times when there are problems. E.g. Millbay area residents say that commuter parking/Cremyll Ferry parking use the residents bays outside of the 10-5pm restriction preventing them from parking when they get home. This could be exacerbated once Strand St carpark charges are brought in. • 2 Hour restricted bays are not enforceable – need metered parking free for 2 hours no return. • Adelaide Homezone area – TRO is only for 11am -3pm – may be a case to extend the timescale and also needs to extend the area to include lanes up to Toys R US as these are being used/abused and are often completely blocked by local businesses parking/working on cars. • Survey all existing TROs and ensure they are complete and enforceable e.g. Incomplete Yellow Lines on Manor St and unenforced 2 hour waiting zone allows relatively new and existing vehicle repair businesses to use the area as garage forecourts with vehicle recovery trucks regularly parked and cars being worked on in spaces outside the Children’s Centre. E.g. Claremont St has yellow lines in place but the TRO does not correspond with the lines to the end - therefore inconsistent enforcement – residents been lobbying to have it rectified for over 1 year – no response! • Need more targeted enforcement of particular hotspot areas. • Any further action that could be taken on persistent offenders e.g. Union St Car Sales received tickets

almost daily for persisting in parking on pavement next to yellow lines on Rendle St – blocking access for parents/pushchairs who have to walk in the road to get by – but they still persist in this nuisance practice.

- Areas such as Millbay/City Centre perimeter could be residents parking and 2 hour restrictions – then there is still an offer for quick visit parking but commuter parking is addressed, and residents have a better chance of parking when they want to – whilst other users get to use spaces when people are at work. (e.g. Durnford St is all residents parking but there are frequently lots of spaces during the restriction times).

There is also an important message that whilst we want to make it easier for people to park near their homes, by excluding all other parking, we give the message that there is an entitlement to park – which there isn't and given there are more cars than spaces, we should avoid encouraging that expectation.'

<p>A resident of Drake ward</p>	<p>'The current system of 'controlled zones' that apply a limitation period of an hour 'no-parking' at various times of the day actually (like several other PCC policies) miss the point. Plymouth residents who live anywhere within a 1½ - mile radius of the City Centre are entitled to live entirely at peace 24/7, without having to be afraid of moving their car for fear of losing the space to casual city visitors, any of whom can use the excellent cheap park-and-ride systems already in place. Therefore, in view of the fact that city-centre shopping is now 7-days-a-week, all areas within the a 1½ -mile radius should be 'strictly-no-parking' at all times, other than for residents with permit-holders or residents' visitors.</p> <p>In other words in fairness to residents there is no justification for parking zones which allow a "free-for-all anytime except for 1 hour during the day Mondays to Saturdays". The Government, and Local Governments (including, supposedly, Plymouth), are united in their drive to proactively encourage would-be car-drivers to use public transport more, even if only park-and-ride schemes. Therefore condoning any visitor-parking at all in residential streets within 1½ -mile of the city centre is unsustainable. London has 'congestion zones' to dissuade people from driving through the city and to get them to use London Transport instead. Therefore there is nothing to stop Plymouth City Council setting a similar objective, i.e. by banning ALL 'casual' parking within a radius of 1.5 miles of the city centre (i.e. far enough to deter 'park-and-walkers').</p> <p>If the object of the current system is to allow some areas to be used for part-day parking for shoppers, workers, or university staff/students, I say this.....let them swop houses with me and I will happily live further out or even in the country. I live where I do because this is all I can afford, and that applies to many. So let the better-off park elsewhere and use public transport and leave the less-well-off in peace.</p> <p>If, on the other hand, the object is to save money by employing a pair of wardens to cover several zones in the one day, then rationality says that they can still do that, but randomly, and that would still be a sufficient deterrent for all-day residents-only parking.'</p>
---------------------------------	---

PARKING SERVICE RESPONSES to Questions of 06/02/2014 Meeting.

- Q1) To flag to the AD for Street Services about the issue of students parking/ not being provided with permits
- Q2) To find out with regards to Nottingham if a resident permits were cheaper than students'?
- A2) i) Resident parking permits in Nottingham are free of charge and valid for a period of 2 years. The maximum allocation of permits per household is 3 and this is made up of any combination of residents or visitors permits.
 ii) Student permits are valid for 1 academic year (i.e. 1 August to 31 July) and are subject to a charge of £70.00 per permit. The maximum allocation of student permits per household is 3 and this is made up of any combination of residents or visitors permits.
- Q3) How much is the permit for Kassam Stadium?
- A3) i) All Kassam Stadium zone car permits (enforced on Sundays 8:30am-1:30pm and match days) are a charge of £11.00 per a permit.
 ii) Other resident permits are charged as follows: The charge for an annual permit will normally be £50 for each of the first two vehicles. Only in zones where more than 2 vehicles are permitted, the 3rd permit will be £100 and 4th and subsequent permits will cost £150.
 iii) If a permit is purchased part way through a year, a reduced rate based on the number of full plus part months is made as listed below:

Months	<u>1st/2nd car</u>	<u>3rd</u>	<u>4th</u>	<u>Kassam Zone</u>
12	£50.00	£100.00	£150.00	£11.00
11	£46.00	£92.00	£138.00	£11.00
10	£42.00	£84.00	£125.00	£10.00
9	£38.00	£75.00	£113.00	£9.00
8	£34.00	£67.00	£100.00	£8.00
7	£30.00	£59.00	£88.00	£7.00
6	£25.00	£50.00	£75.00	£6.00
5	£21.00	£42.00	£63.00	£6.00
4	£17.00	£34.00	£50.00	£5.00
3	£13.00	£25.00	£38.00	£4.00
2	£9.00	£17.00	£25.00	£3.00
1	£5.00	£9.00	£13.00	£2.00

- Q4) To confirm if Catering Vans are able to park anywhere.
- A4) The short answer is no. PCC TRO restricts Catering Vans from parking in all residents or pay & display bays and PCC as a whole restricts street trading, which includes catering vans, to streets that either have consent or are prohibited, as explained in the following information. A list of the current streets is attached for information:-

**PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL CITY CENTRE STREET TRADING CONSENTS
CITY CENTRE SITES**

Site	Consent fee (subject to committee approval)	Order of preference (1= most preferred)
2A New George Street (o/s TJ Hughes)	£5,964	
2B New George Street (o/s WH Smiths)	£5,964	
2D New George Street	£5,964	
9 New George Street (o/s Waterstones)	£5,964	
3A Bedford Way	£3,591	
3B Bedford Way	£5,964	
4A Old Town Street	£3,591	
7 New George Street	£2,758	
8 New George Street (Winter)	£2,316	
8 New George Street (Summer)	£1,213	
10 Sundial East	£7,112.80	
11 Sundial West	£7,112.80	
12 Cornwall Street (o/s Superdrug)	£4,000	
13 Place de Brest East	£4,000	
14 Cornwall Street (o/s Specsavers)	£4,000	

The current fee includes business rates. A £400 refundable deposit is payable in addition for the use of a street trading stall.

“Street trading licence

Street trading is defined as the selling or offering for sale of any article in the street. This includes food such as burgers, kebabs, doughnuts or other things such as jewellery, household items plus face painting, hair braiding.

Streets within the city centre are designated as either consent or prohibited streets. No trading is permitted from a prohibited street. Within the consent streets there are 14 designated street trading sites. Trading can only take place from these specific sites and merchandise has to be approved by us. Any person who wishes to sell items in the city centre must first contact us to see whether there is an available site. These sites are allocated for a 12 month period and have to be applied for each year. We reserve the right to refuse any application without disclosing our reasons.

Certain sites are also available for ice cream sales on the Hoe foreshore, these are issued in January and run from 1 April to 31 March annually.”

Q5) To find out from other Local Authorities when they shifted to generally 24/7 control...Plymouth seems to have an organic CPZ system with 53 zones, did other Local Authorities experience this problem and then change to what they have in place now?

A5) The Parking Service spoke to 4 authorities responded that CPZ operational times were mostly decided with and after consultation with residents and amended at their request. Portsmouth, whose operational residents permits are currently 24 hours daily Monday to Sunday are considering introducing additional short time CPZ's in outer areas of the City that have been impacted on by the 24 hour restrictions.

Further information was gathered from 3 additional Councils who were asked if they had previously had short term operational times ie: 1 or 2 hours.

	Council	Hours of Operation
1	Portsmouth	Portsmouth Council operates an 8am – 8pm policy which deters business owners from parking during the day. They are currently advertising several zones with shorter 2 hour restrictions (2pm - 4pm). It is a new zone to be created on the outskirts of an existing zone and is most likely due to residents complaining that their streets are being used for parking by commuters avoiding the restricted CPZ areas.
2	Nottingham	Nottingham Council has 1 or 2 residents parking zones with a 2 hour restriction. Some zones have “split” restrictions, for example 10am -12 noon then 2pm - 4pm. One zone increased operational hours from 8am – 6pm to 8am – 8pm at the request of residents.

3	Southampton	Operates long time restrictions but allows shorter 1-2 hour “visitor times” throughout the day in different zones. Because of the size of the City the Council fully consult with residents for their requirements for operational hours; no amendments are made without first consulting residents.
4	Cambridge	Has two zones where residents permits are fixed at 8am – 6pm and business permits fixed at 8am - 8pm. This was the result of a review where residents requested these times.

Q6) Criteria for business permits to be detailed – 3 types of permit city wide to be explained

A6) Business parking permits are available to some businesses within Plymouths’ controlled parking zones. Not all businesses are eligible for business permits. A business permit entitles parking within a defined area but does not guarantee an actual parking space. All permits and time clocks must be correctly and clearly displayed so that all the information on the permit can be viewed by a Civil Enforcement Officer. Time clocks must be correctly displayed to show the time of arrival. Vehicles not displaying a permit and/or time clock correctly are liable for the issue of a Penalty Charge Notice.

Business Permit

Permit for businesses that require frequent and short term parking within residents parking bays for up to 2 hours, with no return in 1 hour, within the zone of the registered business. Permits can only be used by the vehicle for which the permit is issued to.

Business Support Permit

Permit for businesses requiring short term parking of up to 5 hours, with no return in 30 minutes, within the zone of the registered business. Permits may also be used within pay and display bays, within the zone of the registered business, up to a maximum of five hours, unless the pay and display bays have a time restriction of less than 5 hours, where the maximum stay still applies. Permits are not vehicle specific and can be used by all employees, clients and customers. A maximum of 5 permits may be issued per business address. Permit valid between 8am and 6pm 7 days a week.

Business Employee Permit

Permit which allows unrestricted parking in residents parking bays within the zone of the registered business. Permits are only available to businesses within zones DD, E, GG, I, P, R, V, TA-C and WI-3.

Please note that the above permits do not provide exemption from any traffic regulation orders. If permits become unreadable please ensure you arrange for a replacement as a Penalty Charge Notice may be issued where information on a permit is not legible.

- Q7) To provide info to 20 March meeting – a question and answer checklist – what has been learnt from other local authorities and from benchmarking – what should we do and what should we avoid.
- Q8) If poor parking outside of the designated lines is restricted to the length of the vehicle only – is it a traffic offence?
- A8) Yes this is a contravention of the TRO relating to both pay and display bays, which are marked individually by length and also lengths of residents parking bays which are not individually marked. With regards to length of residents parking bays, it is in contravention of the TRO if a vehicle is parked over the end of the designated lines of the length of the bay and onto another highway restriction; ie: if a vehicle is parked half in a residents parking bay and half on double yellow lines the PCN would be issued for 'parking on double yellow lines' (regardless of whether the vehicle has a valid parking permit).

This page is intentionally left blank